Establish Maintain Restore

Kristine Lee
Lilliann Nguyen
Larissa Gaias, PhD
Stephanie Brewer, PhD
Importance of Student-Teacher Relationships

Student-Teacher Relationships

- School Belonging
- Social, Emotional & Behavioral Health
- School Engagement
- Academic Achievement
Establish - Maintain - Restore (EMR)

Establish

Making sure no child falls through the relational cracks.

Maintain

Ongoing efforts to keep positive relationships intact.

Restore

Repairing relationships following negative interactions.
Establish - Maintain - Restore (EMR)

Framework for relationships

Shared Relationship Practices
EMR in Elementary & Middle School
EMR in Elementary & Middle Schools

![Teacher-Student Relationship by Race](chart.png)
EMR in High School

Student–Teacher Relationships

Relationship Quality

School Belonging
Social, Emotional & Behavioral Health Needs
School Engagement
Academic Achievement

Benner, 2011; Benner & Graham, 2009; Isakson & Jarvis, 1999; Wheelock & Miao, 2005
Focus Groups

Study 1: Expert Summit

- 21 stakeholders, including researchers (n = 7), teachers (n = 7), and district and school administrators (n = 7) participated in the focus groups
- Pre-summit survey
  - Quantitative items assessed participants’ perception of teachers’ understanding of the importance of student-teacher relationships
  - Teachers’ prior training on concrete strategies to build relationships with students
  - Characteristics of students that ninth grade teachers most often struggle to build relationships with
- Nominal Group Technique (NGT) structured group discussions
  - Teachers and administrators were asked to provide suggestions regarding how to enhance equity in student-teacher relationships
  - Researchers, teachers, and administrators were all asked about potential implementation supports for a PD focused on student-teacher relationships
Study 2: Focus groups with administrator, teachers, and students

- Participants included 8 administrators, 4 ninth-grade teachers, 4 support staff (e.g., main office administrative assistant, guidance counselor, school psychologist, security resource officer), and 10 ninth-grade students
- Quantitative Ratings
  - For each EMR segment, participants completed quantitative ratings of the acceptability, feasibility, and likely effectiveness of that segment
- Qualitative Feedback
  - For each EMR segment, semi-structured focus group questions elicited explanations for high/low quantitative ratings (i.e., “Why do you think it was rated this way?”)
Focus Groups Results

Study 1: Expert Summit

- Results suggested the vast majority of participants agreed that student-teacher relationships are critical for student achievement, but very few teachers have received training in relationship-building strategies.
- Almost all participants (95%) endorsed that teachers have weak relationships with students with specific behavior patterns.
  - Stakeholders perceived that teachers have the most difficulty building relationships with students with externalizing behavior, followed by racially incongruent student-teacher relationship.
- The majority of participants (75%) endorsed that teachers struggle to form relationships with students from specific racial/ethnic backgrounds.

Study 2: Focus groups with administrator, teachers, and students

- Stakeholders identified specific recommendations to improve contextual, developmental, and cultural appropriateness of the EMR practices within the context of teacher-student relationships.
- Teachers identified problems with practices that seemed “appropriate for elementary school-aged students.”
- Constructs such as authenticity, content delivery, and wording changes were highlighted in the recommendations that stakeholders provided to enhance the effectiveness of the EMR practice to improve student-teacher relationships.
Revisions Based on Focus Groups

**Study 1: Expert Summit**

- Participants suggested the use of student input, administrative data, and teacher self-reflection to guide time allocation and enhance equity.
- Recommended implementation supports included transparent implementation plans, consistent post-training consultative supports, and the use of student feedback to monitor progress.

**Study 2: Focus groups with administrator, teachers, and students**

- Delivering the practices in a natural and genuine way was emphasized as a way to improve the effectiveness of a practice by the student group.
- Students also identified elements of practices that would come across as “creepy or weird” for a teacher to engage in (i.e., second-hand compliments).
EMR in High School Pilot

- Pre-post design in one school
  - Teachers (n = 15) with at least 50% 9th grade load received 1-day EMR training and attended monthly PLCs
  - 13 White, 1 Black/African American, 1 Multiracial

- 115 ninth-grade students
  - 50.4% Female
  - 61.7% White, 17.4% Multiracial, 8.7% Asian, 6.1% Black/African American, 1.7% Latino, 1.7% Other

- Analyses
  - Difference scores between pre- and post-test
  - Main effects & prediction by race (White vs. non-White)
Pilot Results: Quantitative

Main Effects

- No pre-post difference for full sample
  - Student-teacher relationships (B = .12, p = .14)
  - Prosocial behavior (B = .03, p = .54)
- Significant increases pre-post
  - School membership (B = .26, p < .001)
  - Intrinsic motivation (B = .47, p = .04)
- Significant decreases pre-post
  - Social difficulties (B = -.13, p < .001)
  - Amotivation (B = -.44, p = .01)

Effects by Race (White, Non-White)

- School membership (B = -.194, p = .002)
- Social difficulties (B = .099, p = .014)
- Amotivation (B = .519, p = .015)
Pilot Results: Quantitative

Effects by Race (White, Non-White)

- School membership ($B = -.194, p = .002$)
- Social difficulties ($B = .099, p = .014$)
- Amotivation ($B = .519, p = .015$)
Pilot Results: Quantitative

Effects by Race (White, Non-White)

- School membership ($B = -0.194, p = 0.002$)
- Social difficulties ($B = 0.099, p = 0.014$)
- Amotivation ($B = 0.519, p = 0.015$)

Social Difficulties
Pilot Results: Quantitative

Effects by Race (White, Non-White)

- School membership ($B = -0.194, p = 0.002$)
- Social difficulties ($B = 0.099, p = 0.014$)
- Amotivation ($B = 0.519, p = 0.015$)
Pilot Results: Qualitative

Student Interviews

Is there anything in particular that this teacher does to show that s/he respects your cultural background or identity?

- Treats everyone equally
  - “Has everyone included. Check in with everyone.”
  - “Doesn't treat kids differently. Fair with all kids.”
- Respects diverse cultures
  - “At the start of school, he asked people where they were from; asked about people's background - he listened and was interested.”
  - “He makes sure that he isn't offending anybody like when he talks about controversial topics. Sometimes will try to pronounce a word from a culture that isn't his own. Someone in the class will correct him and he'll make an effort to pronounce it correctly.”
Pilot Results: Qualitative

Teacher Interviews

Did you find that any of the strategies were particularly helpful for building relationships with students of color?

- Banking Time, Ownership of the Problem, 1-on-1s, Empathy Statement

How could the EMR Training & PLCs be improved to better support you in improving relationships?

- Reduce competing priorities
- Clarify purpose, instructions, examples
- Build in refreshers/reminders for EMR practices
- Follow-up and hold one another accountable
Revisions Based on High School Pilot

Study 3: High School Pilot

- Coordinate with district/school admin to improve teacher participation and engagement
- Restructure EMR practices for better understanding
- Integrate equity-explicit components in EMR training
- Create more tools to remember practices and equity components
- Embed accountability structures in the PLC
- Email weekly EMR reminders
EMR Practices

Establish

Maintain

Restore

Ongoing efforts to keep positive relationships intact.

Making sure no child falls through the relational cracks.

Repairing relationships following negative interactions.
With a partner, brainstorm some strategies you use to **establish** relationships with students?
Establish:
With intention, capitalize on the time you have to establish positive relationships with students, especially those who can benefit from it the most

1. Devote time to get to know students
   1a. Banking time
   1b. Know the details of their lives

2. Communicate high expectations and high support
   2a. Express high expectations
   2b. Offer help, proactively and reactively

3. Provide opportunities for voice and choice
   3a. Gather input and act on it
   3b. Provide options

4. Show that you see them
   4a. Positive greetings & farewells
   4b. Talk them up to other adults
Maintain Practice Categories:
Goal is maintain positive relationships that have been established by striving for a 5 to 1 ratio of positive to negative interactions

1. Positive Interactions
   1a. Non-contingent positive interactions
   1b. Contingent positive interactions

2. Preventing Negative Interactions
   2a. Respond progressively
   2b. Responding to unwanted behavior with empathy
Reflection

With a partner, brainstorm some strategies you use to restore relationships with students?
**Restore Practice Categories:**
Goal is reconnect with the student to skillful communicate to restore the relationship

- Letting Go Conversation
- Taking ownership
- Mutual problem-solving
- Statement of care
Equity Levers

- Seek Commonalities
- Gain Perspective
- Know your vulnerabilities
- Gather facts to disprove assumptions

EMR
Seek Commonalities

Minimize perceived differences between yourself and students that contribute to negative out-group bias and stereotyping.

- What do I know about this student’s preferences, values, and/or experiences?
- What preferences, values, and/or experiences do I share with this student?
- How might I recall our common humanity when establishing or restoring my relationship with this student?
Gain Perspective

Understand how a student may be experiencing a particular incident and their experience in the classroom overall.

- What elements of deep culture do I share with a student? Where might there be misalignment? How might I navigate these misalignments when building or restoring relationships?
- How does this student see his/her experience as a learner in the classroom? As a member of this school?
- How might I check the accuracy of my answers to these questions?
Gather Facts to Disprove Assumptions

Intentionally gather objective and counter-stereotypical information to form new mental shortcuts that can inform future responses.

• What do I think of the students’ academic ability? Personality? Culture? Family? How do these beliefs impact how I interact with this student and how I interpret their behavior?

• What behaviors do I expect this student to show/not show? Does he/she actually demonstrate these behaviors?

• What information do I need to gather to disprove my assumptions?
Know Your Vulnerabilities

Recognize when you’re most likely to respond in a biased manner and interrupt that reaction; identify our own blind spots.

• What situations are you least skillful in?
• What student behaviors represent your triggers that increase the likelihood of unskillful reactions?
• Are your triggers more likely to be sparked by particular students?
• How might implicit biases be affecting the impact of these triggers?
EMR Implementation Supports

- Weekly reminder emails
- Consultation as needed
- Professional learning community (PLC)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PLC 1</th>
<th>September</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PLC 2</td>
<td>October</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLC 3</td>
<td>November</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLC 4</td>
<td>December</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLC 5</td>
<td>January</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLC 6</td>
<td>February</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLC 7</td>
<td>March</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLC 8</td>
<td>April</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLC 9</td>
<td>May</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Where are we now?**

- Are we getting there?

**What barriers will get in our way?**

**How do we get there?**

**Where do we want to go?**
EMR in High School: Small-Scale RCT

Waitlist Control

EMR Intervention

EMR Training

Implementation Supports

Assessment #1

Assessment #2

Assessment #3

August

September

January

May

EMR Training